Moving beyond burnout to professional engagement and joy

Martina Schulte, MD

February 10, 2018
Disclosures:

• None
Can we use the word *joy*?

*Don Berwick, MD*

*2017*
I heard it through the grapevine
Objectives

1. Discuss general facts about burnout
2. Explore drivers of burnout and professional satisfaction
3. Examine current literature on frameworks for addressing burnout and enhancing joy
4. Discover actionable interventions to decrease burnout and enhance joy in the clinical setting
Q1 – I have attended a lecture, training or webinar on burnout or resilience in the last...

1. month
2. 1-3 months
3. 3-12 months
4. 1-3 years
5. I have not heard about or participated in education about this topic
International Conference On Physician Health

Toronto, Ontario    October 11-13, 2018
The What: Burnout

*Syndrome characterized by:*

- Emotional exhaustion
- Depersonalization
- Decreased sense of personal accomplishment
Burnout - overview

- first described - 1974 by Freudenberger
  
  *state of fatigue or frustration resulting from professional relationships that fail to produce the expected rewards*

- later defined as the psychological syndrome by Maslach
  
  ✓ occurring in professionals working with people in challenging situations
  ✓ occupational hazard for people-oriented workers
  ✓ environmental factors – high demand, low resources settings

- common norms:
  - be selfless and put others' needs first
  - work long hours
  - do whatever it takes, go the extra mile

- medicine- qualities selected for (Gabbard, *JAMA* 1985):
  - triad of compulsiveness
    - doubt
    - guilt
    - exaggerated sense of responsibility
  - delay gratification
  - perfectionism
Frequency: Burnout

## Risk vs non-physicians

### Physicians

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burnout (MBI)</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>54.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction (WLB)</td>
<td>48.5</td>
<td>40.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Non-physician working US adults

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2011</th>
<th>2014</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burnout (MBI)</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>28.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfaction (WLB)</td>
<td>55.1</td>
<td>60.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Risk by education

RR of burnout versus High School Graduates:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education</th>
<th>OR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master’s</td>
<td>0.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional or doctoral</td>
<td>0.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD or DO</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Consequences

Yerkes-Dodson Curve

Performance

Stress level

Peak performance

Healthy
- Focused
- Motivated
- Healthy tension

Optimum stress

Focused

Fatigued
- Exhaustion
- Panic
- Anxiety
- Anger

Stress overload

Sick
- Fatigued
- Exhaustion
- Panic
- Anxiety
- Anger
- Burn-out & breakdown

Disease

Lame
- Inactive & bored
- Optimum stress

Low tension

Burn-out & breakdown

Disease

High tension

Motivated
Canary in the coal mine
Work Environment- *Christine Maslach*

- Workload
- Control/Autonomy
- Values/meaning
- Fairness
- Community
- Reward
• 449 physicians from 119 practices

• Adverse physician reactions strongly associated with:
  – workflow (time pressure and a chaotic work pace)
  – job characteristics (lack of work control)
  – poor organizational culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factors Affecting Physician Professional Satisfaction and Their Implications for Patient Care, Health Systems, and Health Policy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Quality of care</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Electronic health records</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Autonomy and work control</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Practice leadership</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Values alignment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>● Balanced approach to initiatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Collegiality, fairness and respect</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work quantity and pace</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work content, allied health professionals and support stability</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pay/income</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Regulatory and liability concerns</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Workload</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Control/Autonomy</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Values/meaning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Fairness</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Reward</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Friedberg. Published online, 2013
“Clients do not come first. Employees come first. If you take care of your employees, they will take care of the clients.”

Richard Branson

Virgin atlantic
### Drivers of burnout... and enhancing joy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Driver</th>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Organizational</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Workload</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work efficiency/support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-life integration/balance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy/flexibility/control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values/meaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

West, Mayo Clinic
Burnout affects physicians across all specialties, but it is particularly acute in primary care. Yet only bandages have been applied to address the problem thus far, in the form of stress management, resiliency workshops, and teaching mindfulness to individual physicians.

“...We tell physicians to get more sleep, eat more granola, do yoga, and take better care of yourself. These efforts are well intentioned. The message to physicians, however, is that you are the problem.”
Frameworks for developing action

Health Affairs Blog

Physician Burnout Is A Public Health Crisis: A Message To Our Fellow Health Care CEOs
John Noseworthy, James Madara, Delos Cosgrove, Mitchell Edgeworth, Ed Ellison, Sarah Krevans, Paul Rothman, Kevin Sowers, Steven Strongwater, David Torchiana, and Dean Harrison
March 28, 2017

Diagram:
- Culture of Wellness
- Efficiency of Practice
- Personal Resilience
- Professional Fulfillment
Executive Leadership and Physician Well-being: Nine Organizational Strategies to Promote Engagement and Reduce Burnout

Tait D. Shanafelt, MD, and John H. Noseworthy, MD, CEO

Mayo Clin Proc, 2017
Physician Well-Being: The Reciprocity of Practice Efficiency, Culture of Wellness, and Personal Resilience

Article • August 7, 2017
Key components – Culture of Wellness

- Leadership
- Values alignment
- Voice/input
- Peer support
- Meaning in work
- Community/colllegiality
- Appreciation
- Flexibility
- Culture compassion

Shanafelt. American Conference on Physician Health, 2017
Interventions!
1. Acknowledge and Assess the Problem

2. Harness the Power of Leadership

3. Develop and Implement Targeted Interventions

4. Cultivate Community at Work

5. Use Rewards and Incentives Wisely

6. Align Values and Strengthen Culture

7. Promote Flexibility and Work-Life Integration

8. Provide Resources to Promote Resilience And Self-care

9. Facilitate and Fund Organizational Science

Targeted interventions

Efficiency of practice

- Primary care clinicians at 34 clinics in Midwest and NY
- Work condition measurements:
  - time pressure
  - workplace chaos
  - work control
  - clinician outcomes.
- Work-life measurement
- Chosen interventions fell into 3 categories:
  1) improved communication
  2) changes in workflow
  3) targeted quality improvement (QI) projects

Results

Intervention clinicians

– Improvements in burnout and satisfaction
– Burnout was more likely to improve with
  • workflow interventions
  • targeted QI projects
– Satisfaction and intention trended toward improvement
  • communication
  • workflow
Targeted interventions

Efficiency of practice

• Atrius Health, non-profit, MA Health Group- 740,000 patients

• Package of EHR-related interventions- SWAT
  – IT analysis, training, local support, security and interface issues
  – Workflow observation and analysis

• Pre: provider efficiency score tracked:
  – every screen
  – Click
  – scroll
  – every look at med list, problem list
  – time logged in to system

Atrius Health, American Conference on Physician Health, Presented 2017
Targeted interventions

Efficiency of practice

Interventions

- at-the-elbow support
- EPIC system configuration changes
- operational change
- training for staff
- Technology changes—Dragon, Widescreen, EPCS
• Outcomes:
  – Click savings – estimated 1500 clicks of 4000 estimated/provider/day
  – EPCS adoption rising rapidly
  – Time savings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Unswatted</th>
<th>Swatted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time in navigator (mins/eval period)</td>
<td>248.2</td>
<td>131.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time in notes/letters (mins/eval period)</td>
<td>1020</td>
<td>910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cultivate community culture of wellness

- Control and intervention groups
- Intervention group-
  - 19 biweekly facilitated discussions
  - mindfulness, reflection, shared experience, and small-group learning
- Protected time (1 hr of paid time every other week)

West. JAMA Intern Med, 2014
Cultivate community culture of wellness

- Facilitated small-group curriculum vs control group-
  - improved meaning and engagement
  - reduced depersonalization
  - sustained results at 12 months
Harness power of leadership

*Culture of wellness*

- Surveyed 3896 physicians, 72% response
- Assessed burnout and leadership qualities of immediate and division/department chair
- 12 leadership dimensions- Likert 1-5
- Composite leadership score- 12-60

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 1. Items Evaluating Physician Opinion of the Leadership Qualities of Their Immediate Physician Supervisor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To what extent do you agree or disagree with each of the following statements about (name of immediate supervisor)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holds career development conversations with me(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspires me to do my best(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowers me to do my job(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is interested in my opinion(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourages employees to suggest ideas for improvement(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treats me with respect and dignity(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provides helpful feedback and coaching on my performance(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recognizes me for a job well done(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeps me informed about changes taking place at Mayo Clinic(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Encourages me to develop my talents and skills(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I would recommend working for (name of immediate supervisor)(^a)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall, how satisfied are you with (name of immediate supervisor)(^b)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\)Response options: 5=strongly agree, 4=agree, 3=neither agree nor disagree, 2=disagree, 1=strongly disagree; NA=do not know/not applicable.

\(^b\)Response options: 5=very satisfied, 4=satisfied, 3=neither satisfied nor dissatisfied, 2=dissatisfied, 1=very dissatisfied.
Results

• Physician team leaders and department chair leadership scores correlated with burnout and satisfaction

• Leadership qualities are teachable:
  – keeping people informed
  – encouraging reports to suggest ideas for improvement
  – having career development conversations
  – providing feedback and coaching
  – recognizing a job well done
For each 1 point increase in composite score
  – 3.3% decreased likelihood of burnout
  – 9% increased likelihood of satisfaction
The Big Three!

1. Develop and implement targeted interventions
   1. Workplace efficiencies, workload and workflow
   2. Address EHR challenges

2. Cultivate community

3. Harness the power of leadership
Focus: Individual or Organizational?

Interventions to prevent and reduce physician burnout: a systematic review and meta-analysis

*Colin P West, Liselotte N Dyrbye, Patricia J Erwin, Tait D Shanafelt*

*Lancet.* Published online September, 2016

Controlled Interventions to Reduce Burnout in Physicians
A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

*Maria Panagioti, PhD; Efharis Panagopoulou, PhD; Peter Bower, PhD; George Lewith, MD; Evangelos Kontopantelis, PhD; Carolyn Chew-Graham, MD; Shoba Dawson, PhD; Harm van Marwijk, MD; Keith Geraghty, PhD; Aneez Esmail, MD*

*JAMA Intern Med.* Published online December, 2016
Interventions

**Organizational**
- Duty-hour requirements-reference
- Shorter attending rotations
- Shorter resident shifts in ICU
- Float pools for planned absences
- Small amt of protected time

**Individual**
- Meditation/Mindfulness
- Stress management training
- Communication skills training
- Narrative medicine
- Small group curricula and belonging interventions
### Drivers of burnout... and enhancing joy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Driver</th>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Organizational</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Workload</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work efficiency/support</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-life integration/balance</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy/flexibility/control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values/meaning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

West, Mayo Clinic
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Driver</th>
<th>Individual</th>
<th>Organizational</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Workload</td>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>Productivity targets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Duty hour requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Integrated career development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work efficiency/support</td>
<td>Efficiency skills training</td>
<td>EMR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Staff support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Workflow redesign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work-life integration/balance</td>
<td>Self-care</td>
<td>Meeting schedules</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mindfulness</td>
<td>Off hours clinics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MBSR</td>
<td>Curricula during work hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Financial support/counseling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autonomy/flexibility/control</td>
<td>Stress management</td>
<td>Physician engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mindfulness</td>
<td>Work hour options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Engagement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values/meaning</td>
<td>Positive psychology</td>
<td>Core values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflection and self</td>
<td>Protect time with patients</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>awareness</td>
<td>Promote community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mindfulness</td>
<td>Work learning community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Small group approaches</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What can I do for myself?
Purpose, meaning, values

- positive attitude
- cognitive flexibility through positive reappraisal
- **embrace a personal moral compass**
- find a resilience role model
- face your fears
- develop active coping skills
- establish and nurture a supportive social network
- attend to physical well-being
- train regularly and rigorously in multiple areas
- recognize, utilize and foster signature strengths
Purpose & Meaning

• Career Fit and Burnout Among Academic Faculty
  - 556 physicians sampled, 465 (84%) responded
  - Spending <20% of professional work time on most meaningful activity had higher burnout
  - Time spent on most meaningful activity was the largest predictor of burnout

8 strategies to increase wellness

Dyrbye, Mayo Clinic

- Optimize meaning in work and life- I know and live my purpose!
- Avoid over commitment- I know my personal values and make decisions consistent with them
- Reduce work-home conflicts- How often do I decide in favor of home versus work?
- Take vacation
- Exercise- CDC guideline
- Build relationships- I pay attention to family and friends and actively seek connectedness
- Avoid delayed gratification- I am living my bucket list...
- Reduce work hours
Q2 - Which of these 8 strategies are you doing well for yourself?

1. Optimize meaning in work and life- I know and live my purpose!
2. Avoid over commitment- I know my personal values and make decisions consistent with them
3. Reduce work-home conflicts- How often do I decide in favor of home versus work?
4. Take vacation
5. Exercise- CDC guideline
6. Build relationships- I pay attention to family and friends and actively seek connectedness
7. Avoid delayed gratification- I am living my bucket list...
8. Reduce work hours
Q3 - Which of these strategies would you like to incorporate more in your life?

1. Optimize meaning in work and life- I know and live my purpose!
2. Avoid over commitment- I know my personal values and make decisions consistent with them
3. Reduce work-home conflicts- How often do I decide in favor of home versus work?
4. Take vacation
5. Exercise- CDC guideline
6. Build relationships- I pay attention to family and friends and actively seek connectedness
7. Avoid delayed gratification- I am living my bucket list...
8. Reduce work hours
Strategy: ____________________________

• What have I tried to make this happen?
  ______________________________________
  ______________________________________
  ______________________________________
  ______________________________________

• One step I will take this week to make this happen:
  _______________________________________
• Individual interventions help
• But, burnout is a system issue
• Creating joy in practice necessitates systems interventions
• Studies are happening
• Ways forward are emerging
  – Building community/support
  – Site-specific workflow efficiencies & interventions
  – Leadership development
But while waiting for systems to catch up ...

- Take care of yourself
- Be clear on what
  - brings you joy
  - you value
- Let your purpose, joys and values be your guide your decision-making
THANKS

Marti Schulte
mschulte@schultecpc.com
Consequences - references

- **Errors/Safety**
  - Welp. Front Psychol 2017

- **Unprofessional behavior/impaired professionalism**
  - Dyrbye. JAMA, 2010

- **Medication adherence**

- **Staff turnover and reduced hours**

- **Depression and suicidal ideation**
  - Shanafelt., *Arch Surg* 2012

- **Alcohol use**
  - Oreskovich. *Arch Surg* 2012

- **Mortality**
  - Welp. *Front Psychol* 2017